# Weyl semimetals — from chiral anomaly to fractional chiral metal

# Jens Hjörleifur Bárðarson

Max Planck Institute for the Physics of Complex Systems, Dresden KTH Royal Institute of Technology, Stockholm





J. Behrends, A. G. Grushin, T. Ojanen, JHB Phys. Rev. B **93**, 075114 (2016) F. Arnold, ...A. G. Grushin, JHB, ... C. Felser, E. Hassinger, B. Yan Nat. Comm. **7**, 11615 (2016) T. Meng, A. G. Grushin, K. Shtengel JHB arXiv:1602.08856 (to appear in PRB)

# Weyl Fermions

### Weyl fermions



Hermann Weyl (1885-1955) PhD Göttingen 1908 with Hilbert 1908 - 1913 — Göttingen 1913 - 1930 — ETH Zürich 1930 - 1933 — Göttingen 1930 - 1951 — Princeton — My work always tried to unite the truth with the beautiful, but when I had to choose one or the other, I usually chose the beautiful —

**Dirac** equation

$$(i\gamma^{\mu}\partial_{\mu} - m)\,\psi = 0$$

 $\gamma^{0} = \begin{pmatrix} \mathbb{1} & 0 \\ 0 & -\mathbb{1} \end{pmatrix} \qquad \gamma^{i} = \begin{pmatrix} 0 & \sigma_{i} \\ -\sigma_{i} & 0 \end{pmatrix}$ 

Massless Weyl fermions: m = 0

$$\psi = \begin{pmatrix} \psi_1 \\ \psi_2 \end{pmatrix} \to \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \begin{pmatrix} \psi_1 + \psi_2 \\ \psi_1 - \psi_2 \end{pmatrix} = \begin{pmatrix} \psi_L \\ \psi_R \end{pmatrix}$$

$$(i\partial_t \pm \mathbf{p} \cdot \boldsymbol{\sigma})\psi_{R/L} = 0$$

Accidental crossing of two bands in 3D band structure is a Weyl point



$$H = \begin{pmatrix} A & B \\ B^* & C \end{pmatrix} = a + \mathbf{b} \cdot \boldsymbol{\sigma}$$

 $H(p_x, p_y, p_z) = a(\mathbf{p}) + \mathbf{b}(\mathbf{p}) \cdot \boldsymbol{\sigma}$ 

# Note a(p) ! Type II Weyl semimetals

see, e.g., Soluyanov et al Nature 2015

$$\mathbf{b}(\mathbf{p}_*) = 0$$
  
$$b_i(\mathbf{p}) = \sum_j b_{ij}(\mathbf{p} - \mathbf{p}_*)_j + \mathcal{O}((\mathbf{p} - \mathbf{p}_*)^2)$$
  
$$b_{ij} = \frac{\partial b_i}{\partial p_j}\Big|_{\mathbf{p} = \mathbf{p}_*}$$

$$H' = \sum_{i,j} \sigma_i b_{ij} (\mathbf{p} - \mathbf{p}_*)_j \quad \rightarrow \mathbf{p} \cdot \boldsymbol{\sigma}$$

C. Herring, Phys. Rev. 1937 E. Witten arXiv:1510.07698 At low energy Weyl semimetals are described by Weyl fermions



 $\mathbf{A}E$ 

# $H = \mathbf{p} \cdot \boldsymbol{\sigma} = p_x \sigma_x + p_y \sigma_y + p_z \sigma_z$

# Scalar disorder is irrelevant for 3D Weyl nodes



## Weyl node is a topologically stable monopole of Berry flux



In momentum space the monopoles always come in pairs





Nielsen & Ninomiya Nucl. Phys. B 1981 Volovik JETP Lett. 2014; *The Universe in a Helium Droplet* 2003

# The minimal model of a Weyl semimetal has two Weyl nodes



Weyl semimetals necessarily break time reversal and/or inversion symmetry

Inversion symmetry

$$egin{aligned} \mathbf{k} &
ightarrow - \mathbf{k} \ &\sigma &
ightarrow \sigma \ &arepsilon_{\uparrow}(\mathbf{k}) = arepsilon_{\uparrow}(-\mathbf{k}) \end{aligned}$$

Time reversal symmetry

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbf{k} &\to -\mathbf{k} \\ \sigma &\to -\sigma \\ \varepsilon_{\downarrow}(\mathbf{k}) &= \varepsilon_{\uparrow}(-\mathbf{k}) \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{array}{c} \begin{pmatrix} \uparrow \\ \bullet \\ \bullet \\ & \downarrow \\ &$$

TRS + IS Dirac semimetal  $\varepsilon_{\uparrow}(\mathbf{k}) = \varepsilon_{\uparrow}(-\mathbf{k}) = \varepsilon_{\downarrow}(\mathbf{k})$ 

# Weyl (and Dirac) semimetals exist!

#### Dirac semimetals — 2014

#### Na<sub>3</sub>Bi

Xu et al. Science 2015 Liu et al. Science 2014 Kushwaha et al. APL Mat. 2015 ...

#### $Cd_3As_2$

. . .

. . .

Neupane et al. Nature Comm. 2014 Borisenko et al. PRL 2014 Yi et al. Sci. Rep. 2014 Liu et al. Nature Mater. 2014 Liang et al. Nature Mater. 2014 He et al. PRL 2014

#### See Claudia Felser's talk!

#### Weyl semimetals — 2015

Weng et al. PRX 2015 (th)

#### TaAs

Xu et al. Science 2015 Yang et al. Nature Physics 2015, Lv et al. Nature Physics 2015, PRX 2015

#### NbAs

. . .

. . .

. . .

Xu et al. Nature Physics 2015



# Fermi Arcs

In momentum space the monopoles always come in pairs





Nielsen & Ninomiya Nucl. Phys. B 1981 Volovik JETP Lett. 2014; *The Universe in a Helium Droplet* 2003

### In some parts of momentum space, Dirac string cuts a plane odd times



### In some parts of momentum space, Dirac string cuts a plane odd times



## Topological surface states appear for certain momentum values

 $\mathbf{A}E$ 

 $k_z$ 



The Fermi arc separates occupied and unoccupied surface states



# Quantum oscillations from Fermi arcs



![](_page_17_Picture_2.jpeg)

Potter, Kimchi, Vishwanath, Nature Comm. 2014 Baum, Berg, Parameswaran, Stern PRX 2015 Moll, Nair, Helm, Potter, Kimchi, Vishwanath, Analytis, Nature 2016

# Chiral anomaly

# Chiral anomaly in a Weyl semimetal

![](_page_19_Picture_1.jpeg)

$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t} (n_L + n_R) = 0$$
$$\frac{\partial}{\partial t} (n_L - n_R) = \frac{e^2}{2\pi^2 \hbar^2} \mathbf{E} \cdot \mathbf{B} - \frac{n_L - n_R}{\tau_v}$$

Nielsen & Ninomiya Phys. Lett. B 1983; Volovik JETP Lett 1999; Aji PRB 2012 see also Burkov 1502.07609 and references within

# Zero Landau level is chiral

![](_page_20_Picture_1.jpeg)

$$H = \chi(\mathbf{p} - e\mathbf{A}) \cdot \boldsymbol{\sigma} \qquad \chi = \pm \quad \mathbf{B} = B\mathbf{e}_{3}$$

$$a_{p_{2}} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} \left( \frac{x_{1} - p_{2}\ell_{B}^{2}}{\ell_{B}} + ip_{1}\ell_{B} \right)$$

$$[a_{p_{2}}, a_{p_{2}}^{\dagger}] = 1$$

$$H = \chi \begin{pmatrix} p_{3} & i\sqrt{2}a_{p_{2}}^{\dagger}/\ell_{B} \\ -i\sqrt{2}a_{p_{2}}/\ell_{B} & -p3 \end{pmatrix}$$

$$\psi_{n} = \begin{pmatrix} |n\rangle \\ \lambda|n-1\rangle \end{pmatrix}$$

$$E_{n} = \pm \chi \sqrt{p_{3}^{2} + 2n\ell_{B}^{2}}$$

$$\psi_{0} = \begin{pmatrix} |0\rangle \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \qquad E_{0} = \chi p_{3}$$

# Zero Landau level is chiral

![](_page_21_Picture_1.jpeg)

 $\frac{\partial p_3}{\partial t} = eE$ 

$$\frac{\partial n}{\partial t} = \frac{eE}{2\pi\hbar} \frac{eB}{2\pi\hbar} = \frac{e^2}{4\pi^2\hbar^2} \mathbf{E} \cdot \mathbf{B}$$

# Semiclassical Boltzmann theory gives the same answer

$$\begin{split} \frac{\partial n_{\mathbf{p}}}{\partial t} + \dot{\mathbf{r}} \cdot \frac{\partial n_{\mathbf{p}}}{\partial \mathbf{r}} + \dot{\mathbf{p}} \cdot \frac{\partial n_{\mathbf{p}}}{\partial \mathbf{p}} &= I_{\text{coll}}\{n_{\mathbf{p}}\}\\ \dot{\mathbf{r}} = \frac{\partial \epsilon_{\mathbf{p}}}{\partial \mathbf{p}} + \dot{\mathbf{p}} \times \mathbf{\Omega}_{\mathbf{p}} \qquad \mathbf{\Omega}_{\mathbf{p}} = \mathbf{\nabla}_{p} \times \mathbf{A}_{\mathbf{p}} \qquad \mathbf{A}_{\mathbf{p}} = i \langle u_{\mathbf{p}} | \mathbf{\nabla} u_{\mathbf{p}} \rangle\\ \dot{\mathbf{p}} = e\mathbf{E} + \frac{e}{c} \dot{\mathbf{r}} \times \mathbf{B}\\ \nu^{(i)} &= \frac{1}{2\pi\hbar} \oint d\mathbf{S} \cdot \mathbf{\Omega}_{\mathbf{p}}^{(i)} \in \mathbb{Z}\\ \cdots\\ \frac{\partial n^{(i)}}{\partial t} + \mathbf{\nabla} \cdot \mathbf{j}^{(i)} = \nu^{(i)} \frac{e^{2}}{4\pi^{2}\hbar^{2}} \mathbf{E} \cdot \mathbf{B} - \frac{\delta n^{(i)}}{\tau} \end{split}$$

D. T. Son and B. Z. Spivak PRB (2013)

# The chiral anomaly induced chiral chemical potential tilts the Fermi arc

![](_page_23_Figure_1.jpeg)

### ARPES — Weyl semimetal

![](_page_24_Figure_1.jpeg)

use tight binding model from Vazifeh and Franz PRL 2013 Behrends, Grushin, Ojanen, **JHB** PRB 2016

#### ARPES — Weyl semimetal

![](_page_25_Figure_1.jpeg)

use tight binding model from Vazifeh and Franz PRL 2013 Behrends, Grushin, Ojanen, **JHB** PRB 2016

# Dirac semimetal as two copies of a Weyl semimetal

![](_page_26_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_26_Figure_2.jpeg)

Young et al. PRL 2012,... Behrends, Grushin, Ojanen, **JHB** PRB 2016

## ARPES — Dirac semimetal

![](_page_27_Figure_1.jpeg)

use tight binding models from Wang et al. PRB 2012; PRB 2013

Behrends, Grushin, Ojanen, JHB PRB 2016

## **Experimental estimates**

Na<sub>3</sub>Bi

. . .

 $E = 10^4 \, \mathrm{V \, m^{-1}}$ 0.8 0.6 B = 1 mTI/Imax 0.4  $\tau_{v}/\tau_{c} = 10^{4}$ 0.2 $\delta \mu = \mu_L - \mu_R \approx 10 \text{ meV}$ 0.0 0.8 But, ARPES doesn't like B! 0.6  $1/I_{\rm max}$ Magnetic substrate 0.20.0 Pump-probe -0.2

![](_page_28_Figure_3.jpeg)

discussion of scattering times: Parameswaran et al. PRX 2014 Behrends, Grushin, Ojanen, JHB PRB 2016

# Transport: negative magnetoresistance

#### Semiclassical Boltzmann theory and conductance

$$\frac{\partial n^{(i)}}{\partial t} + \boldsymbol{\nabla} \cdot \mathbf{j}^{(i)} = \nu^{(i)} \frac{e^2}{4\pi^2 \hbar^2} \mathbf{E} \cdot \mathbf{B} - \frac{\delta n^{(i)}}{\tau}$$

Chiral magnetic effect:

$$\mathbf{j} = \frac{e^2}{4\pi^2 \hbar^2 c} \mathbf{B} \sum_i k^{(i)} \mu^{(i)}$$

Negative magnetoresistance

$$\sigma_{zz} = \frac{e^2}{4\pi^2\hbar} \frac{(eB)^2 v^3}{\mu^2} \tau \qquad \qquad \tau \gg \tau_{\rm tr}$$

D. T. Son and B. Z. Spivak PRB (2013)

#### Negative magnetoresistance in TaP

$$\sigma = \sigma_0 + \frac{e^4 B^s \tau_a}{4\pi^4 g(E_F)}$$

![](_page_31_Figure_2.jpeg)

Nielsen & Ninomiya Phys. Lett. B 1983, Aji PRB 2012, Son and Spivak PRB 2013, Burkov PRL 2014, PRB 2015

Arnold, ...Grushin, JHB, ... Felser, Hassinger, Yan Nat. Comm. 7, 11615 (2016)

#### TaP has several electron and hole pockets and no well defined chirality

![](_page_32_Figure_1.jpeg)

Arnold, ...Grushin, JHB, ... Felser, Hassinger, Yan Nat. Comm. 7, 11615 (2016)

#### Negative magnetoresistance also for electron pockets in quantum limit

PHYSICAL REVIEW B 92, 075205 (2015)

Pallab Goswami, J. H. Pixley, and S. Das Sarma

![](_page_33_Figure_3.jpeg)

# Gyrotropic magnetic effect

$$j_i = \alpha_{ij}^{\rm GME} B_j$$

$$\alpha_{ij}^{\text{GME}} = \frac{i\omega\tau}{i\omega\tau - 1} \frac{e}{(2\pi)^2 h} \sum_{n,a} \int_{S_{n,a}} dS \hat{v}_{F,i} m_{\mathbf{k}n,j}$$

$$\mathbf{m}_{\mathbf{k}n} = -(eg_s/2m_e)\mathbf{S}_{\mathbf{k}n} + \mathbf{m}_{\mathbf{k}n}^{\mathrm{orb}}$$

$$\mathbf{m}_{\mathbf{k}n}^{\mathrm{orb}} = \frac{e}{2\hbar} \mathrm{Im} \langle \partial_{\mathbf{k}} u_{\mathbf{k}n} | \times (H_{\mathbf{k}} - \epsilon_{\mathbf{k}n}) | \partial_{\mathbf{k}} u_{\mathbf{k}n} \rangle$$

# Fractional chiral metal

# A 4D construction of a Weyl semimetal

![](_page_36_Picture_1.jpeg)

Meng, Grushin, Shtengel, JHB arXiv:1602.08856

# A 4D construction of a Weyl semimetal

![](_page_37_Figure_1.jpeg)

### In presence of interactions first go to quantum limit and bosonize

![](_page_38_Picture_1.jpeg)

$$H_{0} = \sum_{x_{4},p_{2}} H_{0}^{b} \partial \bar{x}_{\overline{z}} \left( R \sum_{r,q,q',p_{2}} (x_{3}, \int x_{4}) \dot{x}_{3} (\partial_{\overline{z}} \Phi_{\overline{z}})_{2} R_{\overline{y}_{3}} (\overline{y}_{3}, \overline{y}_{4}) f^{T} V_{\overline{p}_{2}, \overline{q}pq} (\partial_{\overline{z}} \Phi_{A})_{2} ((v_{\overline{z}}, \partial_{\overline{z}}) d_{4})_{2} (x_{3}, x_{4}) \right)$$

$$V_{p_{2},q,q'} = \frac{v_{F}}{4\pi} \delta_{q,q'} \mathbb{1} + \tilde{U}_{p_{2},q,q'}$$

$$c_{p_{2}}(x_{3}, x_{4}) r_{\overline{p}_{2}} (\overline{x}_{3}^{ix,3} b/2) E_{\overline{p}_{2}} (\overline{x}_{3}^{ix,3} d_{4}) = \delta_{p_{2}} (\overline{x}_{3}^{ix,3} d_{4}) - i \Phi_{p_{2}} (i \lambda_{3}^{ix,2} d_{4}) - i \Phi_{p_{2}} (i \lambda_{3}^{ix,2} d_{4}) + \delta_{p_{2}} (x_{3}, x_{4})$$

$$[\Phi_{rp_{2}}(x_{3}, x_{4}), \Phi_{r'p_{2}'}(x_{3}', x_{4}')] = \delta_{rr'} \delta_{p_{2}p_{2}'} \delta_{x_{4}x_{4}'} i \pi \hat{r} \operatorname{sgn}(x_{3} - x_{3}')$$

Meng, Grushin, Shtengel, JHB arXiv:1602.08856

## **Coupled wires construction**

![](_page_39_Figure_1.jpeg)

$$H_{\text{int}} = \int dx_3 \sum_{p_2, x_4} U c_{p_2}^{\dagger}(x_3, x_4) (\partial_3 c_{p_2}^{\dagger}(x_3, x_4)) (\partial_3 c_{p_2}(x_3, x_4)) c_{p_2}(x_3, x_4)$$

#### Fractional quantum Hall state obtained for correlated hopping

![](_page_40_Figure_1.jpeg)

$$\tilde{\Phi}_{Rp_2}(x_3, x_4) = (m+1)\Phi_{Rp_2}(x_3, x_4) - m\Phi_{Lp_2}(x_3, x_4)$$

 $[\tilde{\Phi}_{rp_2}(x_3, x_4), \tilde{\Phi}_{r'p_2'}(x_3', x_4')] = \delta_{rr'}\delta_{p_2p_2'}\delta_{x_4x_4'}(2m+1)i\pi\hat{r}\operatorname{sgn}(x_3 - x_3')$ 

$$H_{\rm tun}^{(2m)} \sim t U^{2m} \sum_{q,p_2} \int dx_3 \cos\left(\tilde{\Phi}_{Lp_2}(x_3, (q+1)a_4) - \tilde{\Phi}_{Rp_2}(x_3, qa_4)\right)$$

C. L. Kane, R. Mukhopadhyay, and T. C. Lubensky, PRL 2002

Meng, Grushin, Shtengel, JHB arXiv:1602.08856

## The bulk is gapped out by the correlated hopping

![](_page_41_Figure_1.jpeg)

$$H_{\rm tun}^{(2m)} \sim t U^{2m} \sum_{q,p_2} \int dx_3 \cos\left(\tilde{\Phi}_{Lp_2}(x_3, (q+1)a_4) - \tilde{\Phi}_{Rp_2}(x_3, qa_4)\right)$$

Electromagnetic response:

$$j^4 = -\frac{e^3}{4\pi^2(2m+1)}\mathbf{E}\cdot\mathbf{B}$$

## Field theory from minimal coupling and gauge invariance

$$\begin{split} \mathcal{S} &= \mathcal{S}_0[\Phi] + \mathcal{S}_1[\Phi, A_4] + \mathcal{S}_2[\Phi, A_\alpha] \\ \mathcal{S}_1[\Phi, A_4] &\sim t U^{2m} \sum_{q, p_2} \int dx_0 dx_3 \cos\left(\tilde{\Phi}_{Lp_2}((q+1)a_4) - \tilde{\Phi}_{Rp_2}(qa_4) + ea_4 A_4(qA_4)\right) \\ \mathcal{S}_2[\Phi, A_\alpha] &= e \sum_{x_4} \int dx_0 dx_3 j^\alpha A_\alpha \qquad \alpha = 0, 3 \\ &= \sum_{p_2, x_4} \frac{e}{2\pi(2m+1)} \int dx_0 dx_3 \epsilon^{\alpha\beta} \partial_\alpha (\tilde{\Phi}_{Rp_2} - \tilde{\Phi}_{Lp_2}) A_\beta \end{split}$$

 $\partial_{\alpha}j^{\alpha} = 0$ 

$$\rho = \sum_{p_2} \frac{1}{2\pi} \partial_3 (\Phi_{Lp_2} - \Phi_{Rp_2}) = \sum_{p_2} \frac{1}{2\pi (2m+1)} \partial_3 (\tilde{\Phi}_{Lp_2} - \tilde{\Phi}_{Rp_2})$$

Meng, Grushin, Shtengel, JHB arXiv:1602.08856

#### Strong coupling and electromagnetic response: fractional chiral anomaly

$$\begin{split} \tilde{\Phi}_{Rp_2}(qa_4) &- \tilde{\Phi}_{Lp_2}((q+1)a_4) = ea_4 A_4(qa_4) \\ \mathcal{S}_2[A_4, A_\alpha] &= \sum_{p_2} \frac{-e^2}{2\pi(2m+1)} \int dx_0 dx_3 dx_4 \epsilon^{\alpha\beta} A_4 \partial_\alpha A_\beta \\ &\sum_{p_2} \to N_{\text{LL}} = eB_3 L_1 L_2 / 2\pi \end{split}$$

$$j^{4} = \frac{\delta S}{\delta A_{4}} = -\frac{e^{3}}{4\pi^{2}(2m+1)}B_{3}E_{3}$$

#### Action is an anisotropic part of the isotropic 4+1D Chern-Simons action

$$N_{\rm LL} = \frac{B_3 L_1 L_2}{2\pi/e} = \int dx_1 dx_2 \frac{1}{2\pi/e} \epsilon^{\gamma \delta} \partial_{\gamma} A_{\delta}$$

$$\mathcal{S}_2[A_{\mu}] = \frac{-e^3}{(2\pi)^2(2m+1)} \int d^5x \epsilon^{\alpha\beta} \epsilon^{\gamma\delta} A_4(\partial_{\alpha}A_{\beta})(\partial_{\gamma}A_{\delta})$$

compare with

$$\mathcal{S}_{\mathrm{CS}}^{(4+1)}[A_{\mu}] = \frac{-e^3}{6(2\pi)^2(2m+1)} \int d^5x \epsilon^{\mu\nu\rho\sigma\eta} A_{\mu}\partial_{\nu}A_{\rho}\partial_{\sigma}A_{\eta}$$

$$j^4 = -\frac{e^3}{4\pi^2(2m+1)}\mathbf{E}\cdot\mathbf{B}$$

Meng, Grushin, Shtengel, JHB arXiv:1602.08856

#### Surface field theory — fractional chiral metal

3+1D surface state constructed from  $N_{\rm LL}$  copies of the edge theory of 2+1D Chern-Simons theory, labeled by  $p_2$ 

$$\mathcal{S}_{\text{surface}}[\Phi_{R,L}] = \frac{2m+1}{4\pi} N_{\text{LL}} \int_{\partial \Sigma} \left[ \partial_0 \Phi_L \partial_3 \Phi_L - v_F (\partial_3 \Phi_L)^2 - (\partial_0 \Phi_R \partial_3 \Phi_R + v_F (\partial_3 \Phi_R)^2) \right]$$

$$\partial_0 \rho_{R,L} + \hat{r} v_F \partial_3 \rho_{R,L} = 0 \qquad \hat{r} = \pm 1$$

Consistent with current algebra analysis of the 4+1D Chern-Simons field theory

$$S_{\phi F} = \kappa \int_{\partial \Sigma} \partial_0 \phi d\phi \wedge F$$

K. Gupta and A. Stern, Nucl. Phys. B 1995

## Collaborators

![](_page_46_Picture_1.jpeg)

![](_page_46_Picture_2.jpeg)

Jan Behrends

![](_page_46_Picture_4.jpeg)

Adolfo G. Grushin UC Berkeley

![](_page_46_Picture_6.jpeg)

Kirill Shtengel UC Riverside

![](_page_46_Picture_8.jpeg)

Teemu Ojanen Aalto Helsinki

![](_page_46_Picture_10.jpeg)

![](_page_46_Picture_11.jpeg)

**Tobias Meng** 

![](_page_46_Picture_13.jpeg)

Frank Arnold

![](_page_46_Picture_15.jpeg)

Binghai Yan (颜丙海)

![](_page_46_Picture_17.jpeg)

Elena Hassinger and more

Summary: chiral anomaly visualized through the blue note and fractional chiral metals

![](_page_47_Picture_1.jpeg)

#### **Open PhD and Postdoc positions at KTH**

![](_page_47_Picture_3.jpeg)

J. Behrends, A. G. Grushin, T. Ojanen, JHB Phys. Rev. B **93**, 075114 (2016) F. Arnold, ...A. G. Grushin, JHB, ... C. Felser, E. Hassinger, B. Yan Nat. Comm. **7**, 11615 (2016) T. Meng, A. G. Grushin, K. Shtengel JHB arXiv:1602.08856 (to appear in PRB)